

Preschool through Third Grade Office P-3 Literacy Team (READ Act) 201 East Colfax Avenue

READ Act

Request for Advisory List Submissions Part II-Program Review Intervention Instructional Programming 2019-2020

The Colorado Reading to Ensure Academic Development Act (READ Act) requires the Colorado Department of Education to create an advisory list of evidence-based or scientifically based instructional programming in reading (C.R.C., 22-7-1209). Part 2 of the process to create an advisory list of programs involves the use of rubrics to evaluate intervention, supplemental and intervention program materials. A separate rubric is used for each type of instructional program. These rubrics are designed for reviewing programs that teach students to read in English. If a program is teaching reading in another language, the scope and sequence for learning to read in that language must be considered.

Core Programming: A comprehensive program used to teach initial and differentiated instruction in the regular classroom. Core reading programs typically encompass both content (curriculum) and strategies (instruction) for teaching the included domains and skills. They provide the instructional priorities, sequence, delivery methods, and materials to articulate how to teach students so they will achieve grade level standards.

Supplemental Programming: A program selected to supplement intervention reading instruction when the intervention program doesn't provide enough instruction or practice in key areas to meet student needs.

Intervention Programming: A program designed to provide scientifically-based, high-quality instruction for students who are below proficient in reading.

The core, supplemental, and intervention programs will be reviewed in two phases. In Phase 1, expert reviewers will evaluate programs on the key elements and features of scientifically-based reading instruction in the skills areas for which they are designed, including:

- research alignment
- explicit instruction
- sequential instruction
- systematic and cumulative instruction
- coordinated components
- related elements

Programs that meet criteria in Phase 1 will move on to Phase 2. The Phase 2 review involves evaluating the extent to which programs implement effective instructional practices for teaching the essential early literacy skills in the grade levels for which they are designed.

- phonemic awareness
- vocabulary
- phonics
- oral reading fluency
- reading comprehension

An asterisk (*) indicates connection to the Colorado minimum competencies and (**) indicates connection to the Colorado Academic Standards.

Intervention Program Review Rubric

Phase 1: Required Features of Scientifically-Based or Evidence Based Intervention Reading Programs

Se	ction 1: Research Alignment - The program reflects current and		Rating	Evidence/Feedback
confirmed research in reading and cognitive science.				
1.	For the grades for which the program is submitted, the program must include	0	Met	
	evidence of alignment to ESSA Evidence Level 1, 2, 3 or 4.	0	Not met	
2.	The program provides evidence of being grounded in conceptual research	0	Fully met	
	and theoretical models with reference to research articles and websites. If	0	Partially met	
	the program is constructed for learning to read in a language other than	0	Not met	
	English, provide the conceptual and research foundations, as well as			
	evidence that it is not merely a translation of an English program.			
3.	There is an obvious emphasis on teaching and learning the essential early	0	Fully met	
	literacy skill(s) targeted by the program.	0	Partially met	
		0	Not met	

Sec	ction 2: Explicit Instruction – Students are introduced to the new skill		Rating	Evidence/Feedback
bet	fore they are asked to perform it.			
1.	Lessons include instructional routines and/or scripts.	0	Fully met	
		0	Partially met	
		0	Not met	
2.	Routines include language for the teacher to introduce, define or explain	0	Fully met	
	new skills through demonstration and modeling before students are asked to	0	Partially met	
	perform the skills.	0	Not met	
3.	There are multiple opportunities for students to practice new skills with	0	Fully met	
	instructions for the teacher to give immediate corrective feedback.	0	Partially met	
		0	Not met	

Section 3: Sequential Instruction - There is a detailed scope and sequence including 1) a list of specific skills taught, 2) a sequence for teaching the skills over the course of the year, and 3) a timeline showing when skills are taught (by week, month, unit).	Rating	Evidence/Feedback
1. The scope and sequence for a skill shows a clear progression from easier to harder.	Fully metPartially met	

		o Not met
2.	Advanced skills are not introduced before students have been taught pre-	o Fully met
	requisite skills.	o Partially met
		o Not met
3.	The scope and sequence articulates when skills are taught across a	o Fully met
	continuum.	o Partially met
		o Not met

Sec	tion 4: Systematic & Cumulative Instruction – The structured lesson	Rating	Evidence/Feedback
for	mat includes a plan, procedure, or routine that is carried through the		
seq	uence of teaching skills.		
1.	A clear and consistent lesson format is evident.	o Fully met	
		 Partially met 	
		o Not met	
2.	There is a daily schedule of lessons noting suggestions for the length of	o Fully met	
	lessons and units.	o Partially met	
		o Not met	
3.	Lessons are primarily delivered in small group.	o Fully met	
		o Partially met	
		o Not met	
4.	Independent or group practice occurs after teacher-led instruction on the	o Fully met	
	skill.	 Partially met 	
		o Not met	
5.	Lessons include instructional routines, noting what the teacher should say,	 Fully met 	
	which includes a step-by-step sequence, procedures, and consistent	 Partially met 	
	language across lessons and grades.	Not met	
6.	The teacher manual(s) include directions for how to implement lessons	 Fully met 	
	(e.g., materials, target skill, script or wording for how to teach, examples to	 Partially met 	
	use, specific content such as word lists or book list).	o Not met	
7.	High-priority skills are cumulatively reviewed.	o Fully met	
		 Partially met 	
		o Not met	

Se	Section 5: Coordinated Components - Elements of the program are clearly		Rating	Evidence/Feedback
lin	ked.			
1.	The same routines, terminology, and procedures are used across lessons	0	Fully met	
	within the program.	0	Partially met	
		0	Not met	
2.	There is a clear link between foundational skills and higher order skills.	0	Fully met	
		0	Partially met	
		0	Not met	
3.	Differentiation is linked to assessment data, with flexible grouping based on	0	Fully met	
	students' needs and progress.	0	Partially met	
		0	Not met	

Section 6: Related Elements – The program contains features that are		Rating	Evidence/Feedback
optimal for delivering effective instruction.			
1.	Assessment	 Fully met 	
	• Formative (e.g., progress monitoring)	 Partially r 	met
	• Summative (e.g., unit tests)	Not met	
	Framework for data-based decision making		
2.	Environment	 Fully met 	
	Classroom management to support small group instruction	 Partially r 	met
	Motivation for students (e.g, built-in choice, charts/graphs of	Not met	
	progress, immediate feedback on progress).		
3.	Professional Development	 Fully met 	
	Professional development and coaching are available to support	 Partially r 	met
	implementing the program with fidelity.	Not met	

Intensifying Instruction

The following table is intended to illustrate the varying degree of instructional intensity needed when transitioning instruction from a core reading program to an intervention reading program. Although intervention instruction should be focused on the same essential skills, using the same instructional approaches as core and supplemental instruction, it should include instructional design features such as breaking skills into smaller steps, more opportunities to respond, more explicit models, individualization, more concrete examples, immediate corrective feedback, teaching to mastery, and more frequent progress monitoring. For each of the essential early literacy skills, a single item has been identified for illustration purposes only. The table has been adapted from *Planning Standards-Aligned Instruction Within a Multi-Tiered System of Supports* by the National Center on Intensive Intervention. This table is intended to serve as an example only.

Section 1: Phonological and Phonemic Awareness

Rubric Item	Intervention Instruction
Students are taught to analyze spoken words at the phoneme level.	 Monitor student progress frequently and analyze data to detect specific skill deficits. Provide explicit instruction in small steps with emphasis on phonological awareness tasks critical for segmentation. Use multiple, varied opportunities for learning and practice with explicit corrective feedback. Include behavior strategies to support individual needs. Increase opportunities for students to respond with feedback. Collect progress monitoring data weekly, at a level that is sensitive to change, and adjust instruction as needed.

Section 2: Phonics and Word Study

Rubric Item	Intervention Instruction
Regular word types are introduced first (e.g., VC, CVC, CV).	 Monitor student progress frequently and analyze data to detect specific skill deficits. Provide explicit instruction small steps focusing on decoding one type of word pattern (e.g., VC, CVC) at a time beginning with the least difficult first. Focus on phonological awareness tasks that are essential for decoding (e.g., sound segmentation, identifying rhyming words). Teach to mastery before moving on to the next lesson or skill.

	 Use multiple, varied opportunities for learning and practice with explicit corrective feedback. Include behavior strategies to support individual needs. Collect progress monitoring data and skill retention weekly, at a level that is sensitive to data change, and adjust instruction as needed. 						
Section 3: Vocabulary							
Rubric Item	Intervention Instruction						
New words are introduced with a student-friendly definition. Section 4: Text Reading and Fluency	 Monitor student progress frequently and analyze data to detect specific skill deficits. Increase exposure to general academic words when possible. Use concrete, student-friendly definitions for pre-teaching. Use multiple, varied opportunities for small group and individual learning and practice. Incorporate behavior strategies targeted to individual needs. Teach to mastery, check for instructional levels and retention before moving on to the next lessor or skill. Collect progress monitoring data weekly at a level that is sensitive to change, and adjust instruction as needed. 						
section 4. Text Reading and Fluency							
Rubric Item	Intervention Instruction						
Rubric Item Oral reading fluency is built through accurate reading of connected text.	 Monitor student progress frequently and analyze data to detect specific skill deficits. Promote independent repeated reading practice with student-level texts. Focus on critical tasks for fluency including word recognition, phoneme segmentation, and self-correction strategies. Use multiple, varied opportunities for learning and practice with partner reading, choral reading, and Cloze activities using student-level texts. Continue to provide exposure to grade-level text when appropriate. Collect progress monitoring data weekly, at a level that is sensitive to student-level growth relative to previous performance, and adjust instruction as needed. 						
Oral reading fluency is built through	 Monitor student progress frequently and analyze data to detect specific skill deficits. Promote independent repeated reading practice with student-level texts. Focus on critical tasks for fluency including word recognition, phoneme segmentation, and self-correction strategies. Use multiple, varied opportunities for learning and practice with partner reading, choral reading, and Cloze activities using student-level texts. Continue to provide exposure to grade-level text when appropriate. Collect progress monitoring data weekly, at a level that is sensitive to student-level growth relative to previous performance, and adjust instruction as needed. 						

Vocabulary and prior knowledge are used to teach comprehension of simple sentences and short passages.

- Monitor student progress frequently and analyze data to detect specific skill deficits.
- Provide access to text at the students' level.
- Pre-teach content and necessary background knowledge needed for comprehension at the paragraph or sentence level when needed.
- Review explicitly subject-specific and high-utility vocabulary words.
- Use multiple, varied opportunities to focus on concreate concepts for small group and individual learning and practice.
- Incorporate behavior strategies targeted to individual needs.
- Collect progress monitoring data weekly, at a level that is sensitive to change, and adjust instruction as needed.



Intervention Program Review Rubric

Phase 2: Required Instructional Practices for Teaching Essential Early Literacy Skills

Section 1: Phonological and Phonemic Awareness Evidence/Feedback In the intervention instructional program... 2 Rating phonological and phonemic awareness skills progress from easier to Fully met \mathbf{x} more difficult, culminating in advanced skills such as addition, Partially met deletion and substitution of phonemes Not met new skills are explicitly modeled using multiple examples, where the Fully met new skill is introduced, defined and/or explained, a model or Partially met demonstration is provided, students are given opportunity to practice Not met orally with immediate corrective feedback strategies are used to demonstrate and practice how sounds are Fully met \mathbf{x} connected to letters (e.g. phoneme-grapheme mapping) Partially met Not met segmenting at the level of individual phonemes is an instructional Fully met X focus in second half of Kindergarten Partially met Not met students analyze spoken words at the phoneme level Fully met X Partially met Not met movement and/or manipulatives are used to make sounds in words Fully met X Partially met concrete Not met the order of attention to phonemes in three-phoneme words is first Fully met X X sound, last sound, middle sound Partially met Not met instructional time is focused on high priority skills such as isolating Fully met \mathbf{x} beginning phoneme, blending, segmenting and manipulating Partially met phonemes Not met students are taught to blend and segment phonemes in three-, four-Fully met X X

Partially met

Draft Intervention Rubric 12.16.19

and five-phoneme words

					0	Not met
10.	students are taught to pull apart the two phonemes in consonant	X	X		0	Fully met
	blends when segmenting				0	Partially met
					0	Not met
11.	students spend time practicing orally producing the sounds in spoken	X	X		0	Fully met
	words, not just identifying the sounds or matching the sounds using				0	Partially met
	objects or pictures				0	Not met

Section 2: Phonics and Word Study							
In the intervention instructional program			1	2	3	Rating	Evidence/Feedback
1.	letter-sound instruction starts with high-utility letters (i.e., m, s, a, r, t)	x				Fully metPartially metNot met	
**2.	letter-sound instruction integrates the letter name, sound, and how to write the symbol	X				Fully metPartially metNot met	
3.	the letter that represents the sound is explicitly modeled before students practice and apply	X				Fully metPartially metNot met	
4.	letter-sound combinations are learned to automaticity through frequent and cumulative review	X				Fully metPartially metNot met	
5.	easily confused letters, letter-sounds and words (those that look or sound similar) are not taught in close sequence but are separated in time	X	X	X	X	Fully metPartially metNot met	
6.	a few short vowel letter-sounds are taught early so students can blend VC and CVC patterns to read and write words	X				Fully metPartially metNot met	
7.	phonics skills progress systematically from simple word types, lengths, and complexities, to more complex words, syllable types, and multi-syllable words (orthographically larger and more complex units)		X	X	X	Fully metPartially metNot met	

8.	the phonics lesson format includes o brief cumulative review of previously taught skills, a phonological warm up, phoneme-grapheme matching, word reading accuracy, fluency building at the word, phrase, sentence and passage level, sentence dictation, transfer to text					 Fully met Partially met Not met
9.	phonics lessons include segmenting at the level of individual phonemes then matching graphemes to phonemes	A	X			Fully metPartially metNot met
10.	there is an explicit strategy for blending letter sounds into words	X	X			Fully metPartially metNot met
**11.	there are multiple opportunities to practice blending letter sounds for the purpose of reading and writing words	X	X			Fully metPartially metNot met
**12.	students are taught and practice how to build regular words for which they know all letter sounds	X	X			Fully metPartially metNot met
13.	students practice to automaticity in word lists, phrases and controlled decodable texts that provide enough exposures to the learned words that they become sight words	X	X			Fully metPartially metNot met
14.	regular word types are introduced first (e.g., VC, CVC, CV)	X	X			Fully metPartially metNot met
15.	irregularities are pointed out in high utility words (i.e., have, I, said) while still focusing attention on the predictable letter-sound combinations	X	X	X	X	Fully metPartially metNot met
16.	irregular, high-utility words are introduced and practiced to automaticity	X	X	X	X	Fully metPartially metNot met
17.	the number of irregular words introduced in a lesson is minimized	X	X	X	X	Fully metPartially met

							Not met		
10	would are tought and learned in inclution before an estimation to task					0			
18.	words are taught and learned in isolation before practiced in text;	X	X			0	Fully met		
	words in texts used for independent reading are the ones that have					0	Partially met		
1.0	been taught in prior phonics lessons					0	Not met		
19.	there is cumulative review of known letter-sound combinations and	X	X			0	Fully met		
	words					0	Partially met		
						0	Not met		
20.	there are repeated opportunities to read words in context of the	X	X	X	X	0	Fully met		
	controlled decodable text that contain the phonic elements and					0	Partially met		
	irregular words students have learned previously					0	Not met		
21.	instruction in patterns and word families is done after letter-sound		X			0	Fully met		
	correspondences in the unit					0	Partially met		
						0	Not met		
22.	a detailed scope and sequence of phonics patterns moves from	Α		X		0	Fully met		
	simple word types, lengths, and complexities to more complex					0	Partially met		
	words, syllable types, and multi-syllable words					0	Not met		
23.	phonics lessons include step by step routines to teach new advanced			X	X	0	Fully met		
	phonics patterns					0	Partially met		
						0	Not met		
24.	previously learned patterns are practiced to automaticity in word			X	X	0	Fully met		
	lists, phrases and controlled decodable text that provide enough					0	Partially met		
	exposures for the words to become sight words					0	Not met		
25.	multi-syllable words are taught using prefixes, suffixes and know			X	X	0	Fully met		
	word parts that are taught explicitly			\		0	Partially met		
	were pure that are anymore,					0	Not met		
26.	larger, high-utility patterns (e.g., -ight, -ing) are taught explicitly and			X		0	Fully met		
20.	practiced to automaticity to increase fluency of word recognition			21		0	Partially met		
	practiced to distinuitely to increase fracticy of word recognition					0	Not met		
27.	high-utility words are introduced and practiced to automaticity			X	X	0	Fully met		
21.	ingli define, words are introduced and practiced to automaticity			Λ	Λ		Partially met		
							Not met		
28.	phonics patterns and high-utility words are taught and learned in	 		v	v	0	Fully met		
28.				X	X	0	•		
	isolation before introduced in text that students read independently					0	Partially met		
20		1				0	Not met		
29.	text for independent reading doesn't contain words that have phonics			X	X	0	Fully met		

	patterns that haven't been taught in prior phonics lessons				0	Partially met Not met
30.	spelling is integrated with the phonics instruction		X	X	0 0	Fully met Partially met
31.	there is sufficient practice in automatic reading of longer, more complex, multi-syllable words			X	0 0	Fully met Partially met Not met

Secti	on 3: Vocabulary						
In th	e intervention instructional program	K	1	2	3	Rating	Evidence/Feedback
1.	words selected for instruction are rich, high-utility words that will appear in conversation and literature, those that must be learned to understand a concept or text, and words from content area instruction	X	X	X	Х	Fully metPartially metNot met	
2.	new words are introduced with a student-friendly definition with examples and non-examples	X	X	X	Х	Fully metPartially metNot met	
3.	words that have been taught are repeated multiple times in a variety of contexts	X	X	X	X	Fully metPartially metNot met	
**4.	new words are integrated into sentences and students are prompted to use them in sentences	х	X	X	х	Fully metPartially metNot met	
5.	students are engaged in processing word meanings at deeper levels, to associate new words with known words	х	X	X	х	Fully metPartially metNot met	
6.	there is cumulative review and practice of previously learned words	х	х	X	х	Fully metPartially metNot met	
7.	students are exposed to a wide range of words through reading aloud from a wide range of stories and informational text	Х	X	Х	Х	Fully metPartially metNot met	
8.	morphemic analysis is taught explicitly and systematically to teach	X	X	X	X	 Fully met 	

	building word meaning through knowledge of root words, prefixes				0	Partially met	
	and suffixes				0	Not met	
9.	students are taught to predict meaning using antonyms and synonyms,		X	X	0	Fully met	
	words in compound words, roots, base words, prefixes and suffixes				0	Partially met	
					0	Not met	
10.	students are taught simple multiple meaning words		X	X	0	Fully met	
					0	Partially met	
					0	Not met	
11.	students are asked to demonstrate understanding word meaning by		X	X	0	Fully met	
	using words in oral and written sentences				0	Partially met	
					0	Not met	
12.	students are taught to use grade-appropriate dictionaries			X	0	Fully met	
					0	Partially met	
		Λ			0	Not met	

Section	on 4: Text Reading and Fluency			\			
In the	e intervention instructional program	K	1	2	3	Rating	Evidence/Feedback
*1.	sentence and passage reading are introduced after students can accurately and automatically read a sufficient number of VC and CVC words along with a few high-utility irregular words		X	X	X	Fully metPartially metNot met	
2.	the text students are asked to read independently includes only the letter-sounds, phonic elements and word types that have been previously taught in phonics lessons		X	X	X	Fully metPartially metNot met	
3.	fluency building in connected text is done only with passages the student can read accurately		X	X	X	Fully metPartially metNot met	
4.	there are sufficient numbers of controlled decodable text that align to the phonics scope and sequence to allow students to practice to automaticity		X	X	Х	Fully metPartially metNot met	
5.	materials are available for teachers to read aloud for the purpose of modeling fluent reading		X	X	X	Fully metPartially metNot met	

In the	intervention instructional program	K	1	2	3	Rating	Evidence/Feedback
1.	students are taught to do an oral retelling of events or stories they listen to					Fully metPartially metNot met	
2.	story structure is explicitly modeled	Λ				Fully metPartially metNot met	
3.	high-utility Tier 2 words are pre-selected and taught before, during and after reading aloud		\			Fully metPartially metNot met	
4.	the materials support engaging in interactive discussion on a wide variety of topics					Fully metPartially metNot met	
5.	selections include questions to model and ask while reading aloud					Fully metPartially metNot met	
6.	a clear scope and sequence guides comprehension instruction, in which the goal of the comprehension unit is explicitly stated and in which the ideas follow a logical order		X	X	Х	Fully metPartially metNot met	
7.	students use controlled decodable text for independent, small group or scaffolded reading instruction until they can accurately read a. one-syllable words in isolation that contain short vowels, digraphs and blends, silent e, r-controlled vowels b. two-syllable words with short vowels, silent e, schwa c. 50 high-utility words with spelling patterns that haven't been taught (e.g., go, he, said, are, to, was, you, they, there, from)		X			Fully metPartially metNot met	
8.	the background knowledge necessary to understand text, that is read to or by students, is explicitly taught or activated		X	X	X	Fully metPartially metNot met	
**9.	there are multiple opportunities to listen to and explore narrative and expository text forms and engage in interactive discussion of the		X	X	X	Fully metPartially met	

	meanings of text					0	Not met		
10.	previously taught skills and strategies are connected with new content	2	X	X	X	0	Fully met		
	and text					0	Partially met		
						0	Not met		
11	a scope and sequence of comprehension strategies are explicitly	2	X	X	X	0	Fully met		
	taught with carefully designed models, applied in appropriate texts,					0	Partially met		
	and practiced with cumulative review over the course of the year					0	Not met		
12.	reading aloud and modeling are used to identify components of story	2	X	X	X	0	Fully met		
	structure, using story structure as a tool for prompting information to					0	Partially met		
	compare and contrast, organize info, and group related ideas to					0	Not met		
	maintain a consistent focus								
13.	text used for initial instruction in reading comprehension uses:	2	X	X	X				
	 familiar vocabulary, 								
	• only words students can read accurately and have been learned					0	Fully met		
	previously,					0	Partially met		
	 previously learned content knowledge, 					0	Not met		
	• simple sentences,								
	• passages that increase in length								
14.	lessons include explicit instruction in analyzing elements of narrative			X	X	0	Fully met		
	text and comparing and contrasting elements within and among texts	\ \				0	Partially met		
						0	Not met		
15.	a coherent sequence of questions and tasks supports students to			X	X	0	Fully met		
	examine language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) and apply		N		\	0	Partially met		
	their knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking and listening					0	Not met		
16.	the specific content knowledge students will learn throughout the year				X	0	Fully met		
	is clearly stated and mapped out across the year		4			0	Partially met		
						0	Not met		
17.	the content taught throughout the year prepares students for later				X	0	Fully met		
	grades					0	Partially met		
						0	Not met		
18.	reading comprehension instruction progresses to more complex				X	0	Fully met		
	structures in which main ideas are not explicit and passages are longer					0	Partially met		
						0	Not met		
19.	reading comprehension is explicitly taught with the aid of carefully				X	0	Fully met		
	designed modeling and practice (monitoring, mental imagery,					0	Partially met		

	question generation, question answering, story structure, summary)			o Not met
20.	topics from science, social studies, math and the arts are integrated		X	o Fully met
	into the content studied through text read aloud by the teacher and			o Partially met
	independent reading			o Not met
21.	lessons include explicit instruction in the structure and use of		X	o Fully met
	conventions of informational text such as titles, headings, information			o Partially met
	from graphs and charts to locate important information			o Not met
22.	complex topics are introduced in a carefully planned sequence		X	o Fully met
	including teachers reading aloud, discussions, and projects, starting			o Partially met
	with a basic introduction and building towards a deeper understanding			o Not met

